

```
IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 1
          FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA
 2
 3
     M. REBECCA DOWNING, et al.,
                        Plaintiffs )
 4
                                    ) Civil Action - Law
                                    ) No. 1:CV-05-0351
 5
               VS
     YORK COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY)
 6
     H. STANLEY REBERT, et al.
                        Defendants )
 7
 8
                           --000--
 9
10
     DEPONENT: Arthur D. Smith, Jr.
11
                Plaintiffs
     TAKEN BY:
12
                Thursday, May 25, 2006
     DATE:
13
                1:45 p.m.
     TIME:
14
                Lavery Faherty Young & Patterson, P.C.
     PLACE:
                225 Market Street, Suite 304
15
                Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17108
                York, Pennsylvania
16
                Karen J. Meister
     REPORTER:
17
                Reporter, Notary Public
18
19
                           --000--
20
21
22
                        KEY REPORTERS
                   keyreporters@suscom.net
23
            1300 Garrison Drive, York, PA 17404
            (717) 764-7801 Fax (717) 764-6367
24
25
```

Page 12

Page 13

Page 10

get it. We always shared information, we worked cases together. I think we had an excellent working relationship, and I believe we still do.

When Miss Downing came to, for lack of a better term, take over the detective unit. become chief, did you consider that a step forward, step back, no change at all for the D.A.'s office?

A I believe --

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

MR. HUTCHINSON: Objection.

BY MR. JACOB:

Q Go ahead, you can answer.

Α I believe it was a step forward.

O And why is that?

My knowledge of her work ethic and 15 working with her and having gone to school with 16 17 her. She was also a MOPEC instructor. And I had many, many sessions where she taught myself 18 and other municipal police officers what the 19

20 state mandated us to know every year to maintain

21 our certification. It was always my opinion

that somebody in that capacity is at the top of 22 23

the field because they know what's expected of

24 them and they're able to instruct that to other

25 police officers. So, that was my experience. 1 BY MR. JACOB:

> 2 Q At any point in time since this 3 litigation has begun, did the York County Chiefs or you, in particular, notice a lack of

> 5 cooperation from the D.A.'s office or Mr. Rebert 6

at all?

7

8

20

1

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

My experience with the York County Chiefs Association was, the Chief County Detective was always the representative from the

10 District Attorney's office. When Miss Downing

11 left that position we had a void in the

12 association. I actually became the president of 13 the York County Chiefs following Miss Downing,

and in that capacity I was very interested in

15 what surrounding counties were doing in respect

16 to their chiefs of police association to the 17 point that I received their minutes, I reviewed

18 their minutes, and I just wanted to see where we

19 were in respect to other counties.

The one thing that I did find was that, in most other counties the district 21

22 attorney was an active representative and a 23 member of those associations. It was at that

point that in meetings I was requested to meet 24

25 with District Attorney Rebert on behalf of the

Page 11

O Now, how about -- And I realize this is difficult. You still need to work within York County. I'm not going to ask you to give any personal opinions about the current chief or anything in that regard.

MR. HUTCHINSON: Excuse me.

(Cell phone interruption.)

(Mr. Hutchinson left the deposition room; and then returns to the deposition room.) BY MR. JACOB:

Okay, back on the record. Again, I'm not going to ask you to give a personal opinion 12 about the current chief, anything in that regard. But just generally, now that Miss Downing is no longer with the D.A.'s office, do you consider that to be a step back for the detective unit?

MR. HUTCHINSON: Objection.

THE DEPONENT: I get along very well with her replacement. I've known Chief Mendez for many, many years. He was with the state police. We had worked cases together, some homicide cases. I believe that he is very professional, and I think that he is very

adequate in maintaining that department.

association to try to get participation in the organization and, if possible, from Mr. Rebert himself as he, of course, speaks for that particular office.

I did have a meeting. It was a one-on-one meeting with Mr. Rebert, and we discussed where we needed to go with this. A request was made at that point that this issue of this lawsuit should be put on the back

10 burner, resolved in court, and we needed to move 11 on with business. Could we have participation

12 from the District Attorney's office either in 13

the way of Mr. Rebert or an attorney to fulfill what we believed was the -- was a need within the organization?

At that time I left the meeting and Mr. Rebert said that he would consider it, and we would see where the future goes with that. To this point we have not had representation from the District Attorney's office at those meetings, and we're hopeful that that will resume at some point in the future.

Am I correct that at one point in time that Mr. Rebert conditioned the cooperation or the participation of the D.A.'s office on

Page 16

Page 17

Page 14 Miss Downing being uninvited from York County 2 Chiefs of Police Association meetings? 3 MR. HUTCHINSON: Objection. 4 BY MR. JACOB: 5 O You can answer. 6 Α That's my understanding. 7 Okay. And the request wasn't just 8

simply that Miss Downing be delisted as not affiliated with the D.A.'s office. It was that she was not to personally attend any of the meetings, correct?

That's my understanding, yes, sir. Α Q Did Mr. Rebert indicate that any other person needed to be uninvited from the meetings, or just Miss Downing?

As I recall, it was just Miss Downing.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

17

18

21

25

Q And did he indicate to you why simply delisting her as associated with the D.A.'s office was not enough?

Α I don't have any knowledge in regard to that.

Do you recall a January 2005 meeting 24 at the Newberry Township Police Department--I guess you probably do--where Miss Downing 25

executive board is my recollection as to what

2 the bylaws are at this time without looking at 3 them.

4 And am I also correct that unless Mr. 0 5 Rebert had objected, she probably would not have 6 been uninvited to the meetings, correct?

A I believe so.

7

12

15

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

8 O Do you recall a meeting in May of 9 2005 at Penn Township when Mr. Rebert approached 10 you and made the request that you order Miss Downing to leave the meeting? 11

> Α Yes.

13 0 And did he state at that time why she should leave? 14

I can't recall that. I recall that 16 Mr. Rebert arrived after the meeting had started with Chief Mendez. The purpose at that point was to introduce Chief Mendez to the group as the new county chief detective -- chief county detective. I was chairing the meeting.

As Mr. Rebert came into the room I greeted him and my recollection is, what's she doing here, referring to Miss Downing. I warned him that she was a member of the association and was so entitled to be there.

25

Page 15

essentially resigned her position as chief and handed the gavel over to you?

Yes, I do.

And did she express at that point in time why she was doing that?

My recollection was that she thought it was in the best interest of the organization to do that at that time.

And did she state why she felt it was in the best interest of the association?

A I think there was discussion about what the bylaws may have said; that if you're not an active member or actively employed as a chief, you couldn't hold that position. She didn't want to create an issue amongst the membership as to whether or not the bylaws should be followed at that time.

Okay. And am I correct that the 19 members of the association encouraged her to become an affiliate member? 20

> Α Yes.

22 O As an affiliate member she would be entitled to attend the meetings at the

24 invitation of the president, correct?

A I believe it's the president or the

We had discussed some options at the time that, you know, you can do what you came to do or stay for the meeting or leave. At that point he chose to introduce Chief Mendez, after which he and Chief Mendez left the meeting.

Was Miss Downing's presence at the meeting an impediment to Mr. Rebert being able to introduce his new chief, or was he able to do it?

He did it. I would say that it wasn't done in a comfortable manner, but he did introduce Chief Mendez at the meeting.

Who caused that discomfort? Was it the fact that he was coming in saying, she needs to leave before he tried the introduction?

MR. HUTCHINSON: Objection.

THE DEPONENT: Miss Downing was at the meeting. Like I said, we already commenced and she didn't voice anything during that period of time, during the meeting or after the meeting. So, I assume that being uncomfortable was on Mr. Rebert at that point. But it wasn't because anything was said or done at that meeting.

25 BY MR. JACOB: